

Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville Council Report	ltem x

Subject:	Proposed Heritage Designation for 77 Mill Street (R01)
Staff Report No.	DS-028-19
Department:	Development Services
Date:	June 4, 2019

Recommendation:

- 1) That Council direct staff to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate for 77 Mill Street in the community of Stouffville as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and
- 2) That Council support the proposed development, shown in Attachment 2 and 3 in this report, that protects the main building at 77 Mill Street, subject to further approvals of the Town's Committee of Adjustment; and
- 3) That should no objections be received during the mandatory 30-day public objection period following publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate, a by-law be enacted for the purpose of designating 77 Mill Street pursuant to the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

1. Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council direction to initiate the heritage designation process for 77 Mill Street, shown in Attachment 1 of this report, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and Council endorsement of a site plan proposed by the applicant through applications CA-19-10 and CA-19-11, subject to further approvals of the Town's Committee of Adjustment.

2. Executive Summary:

Planning staff has undertaken an assessment of the cultural heritage value of 77 Mill Street and determined that the property meets the criteria for heritage designation under Ontario Regulation 9/06 and the *Ontario Heritage Act,* R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18 ("the Act"). The Town's Heritage Advisory Committee (HAC) recommends that Council proceed with

heritage designation of this property under section 29 of the Act. Staff supports the development proposal to sever the lot for two single detached dwelling units with the main building fully protected.

3. Background:

The existing Built Heritage Inventory was adopted by Council on December 17, 2002 and subsequently revised on March 22, 2005 and September 8, 2014. The subject property was identified as being of cultural heritage value or interest indicating that the property "has potential for conservation in some manner".

A development application was received in early 2017 for the construction of a new garage and attached one-and-a-half storey addition. The Residential (Heritage) Site Plan application (SPA-17-027) was review by staff and HAC, and subsequently approved on June 23, 2017. A Building Permit (BA-2017-0170) was issued to a previous owner on July 11, 2017.

On January 7, 2019, an application for a Demolition Permit (BA-2019-0005) was submitted to the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville to demolish the existing single-detached dwelling with the intention of severing the parcel of land and building two new single-detached dwellings on two residential lots. The application was considered and opposed by HAC at its meeting on January 14, 2019. Instead, HAC recommended that the property be designated for its cultural heritage value.

Following the HAC meeting, staff have met with the applicant numerous times to explore a compromise that would include the retention of the existing dwelling while also allowing for the development of the site. Given the limitations of a 60-day abeyance period on active Demolition Permits, staff requested that the applicant withdraw his permit application and the applicant did so in good faith on March 1, 2019.

On March 4, 2019, the applicant submitted a Pre-Consultation Request (PRE-19-010) and on March 18, 2019 the applicant submitted applications for Consent (CA-19-10) and Minor Variance (CA-19-11). The proposal sought to maintain the existing dwelling in situ while severing the lot, building a new dwelling on conveyed lands, and building a new rear addition and garage on retained lands.

On May 15, 2019 the Town's Committee of Adjustment considered and decided to defer the applications. Members of the Committee of Adjustment questioned the cultural heritage value and interest of the property. Following the meeting, planning staff has undertaken a thorough analysis of the property at 77 Mill Street and is convinced that this property has the cultural heritage value to be designated. Staff has shared the study findings with the applicant in a subsequent meeting, and the applicant agreed not to pursue the Demolition Permit to allow staff time to seek a Council direction to issue a Notice of Intent to Designate.

4. Analysis and Options:

4.1 Description of Historic Place

The subject property at 77 Mill Street is located within Lot 1, Concession 9 in the former Township of Whitchurch. Attachments 1 and 5 of this report show the location and views of the subject property. The property is approximately 920.38 square metres in lot area and is located on the east side of Mill Street, approximately 230 metres north of Main Street in a neighbourhood of varied heritage character. A variety of lot sizes, configurations, setbacks, and building styles typify the area. The southern portion of Mill Street North includes a diverse collection of heritage buildings and modern buildings sited closer to the street. The northern portion of Mill Street North is typified by newer, suburban-style homes which are dominated by garages and larger setbacks.

The subject property contains a two-storey single detached dwelling with moulded concrete block built in 1911, and an addition containing a two-car garage built in 2017. The subject property acts as the northern terminus to Mill Street's historic building fabric and acts and a transitional building to modern residential lots (see Attachment 4). The property's heritage designation is reserved to the exterior of the heritage resource itself on the southern portion of the lot and does not extend to any accessory structures or landscape features.

The property is zoned Residential Three (R3) in the Town's Zoning By-law. The R3 Zone permits single detached dwellings, including accessory buildings and structures. The subject property is located within the Town's Heritage Area (Community of Stouffville Secondary Plan, Schedule F) and subject to area-specific policies outlined in the Official Plan.

The subject property is also listed on the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville's Built Heritage Inventory (BHI) as a non-designated property of cultural heritage value or interest. As such, property owners are required under the Ontario Heritage Act to inform Council by providing at least sixty (60) days notice in writing of the intention to remove any buildings or structures on such properties.

4.2 Preliminary Assessment

The existing single-detached dwelling is a two-storey concrete structure with a square plan layout, built in 1911. The dwelling construction is attributed to William Bruels (1857-1931), a local carpenter based in Ringwood, and was built for Ella Matilda Stewart (1866-1939), a widow at the time. Stewart (nee Gray) was born in Ballantrae and later lived in Stouffville. Her 1939 death notice in the *Stouffville Tribune* confirms that Stewart lived at 77 Mill Street for twenty-eight years, since the building's construction in 1911. Stewart was noted as being active locally with Stouffville United Church and the Women's Missionary Society. Despite being a widow for the latter portion of her life, Stewart had five children to two predeceased husbands.

The subject property was originally located on the lands of the Duffins Creek mill pond employed by Abraham Stouffer for saw and gristmills in the early 19th century. Originally, Mill Street functioned an industrial laneway connecting the mill pond to Stouffer's sawmill south of Main Street. The subject property was surveyed in 1888 as part of C.J. Hanning's Plan 61, but the parcel was not developed until 1911. The 1914 *Topographical Map of Ontario, Markham Sheet* shows the northern extension of Mill Street and indicates new buildings in the vicinity of the subject property (see Attachment 5). Both the BHI Survey Sheet and Municipal Property Assessment Corporation (MPAC) data identify the dwelling as being built between 1910 and 1911.

The subject property was constructed with locally manufactured concrete block and built in the Edwardian Classical American Foursquare style. It is characterized by a box-like shape, hipped roof, large windows, front porch, and conservative design. American Foursquare homes were popularized economical options for middles-classes across North America from the turn of the 20th century to the early 1930s. Although the American Foursquare was a common residential style during this period and is well-represented in the community, almost all existing homes were built in brick. There are only two other such concrete buildings in Whitchurch-Stouffville and none within urbanized Stouffville. Concrete block was routinely employed for foundation material and accents such as porch columns, but its use as the exclusive building material is much less common.

The application of this material in Stouffville is attributed to the proximity of the North American Cement Block & Tile Company in Gormley. The Company was in operation as early as 1907 at the intersection of Gormley Road East and the historic railway line. The Company was managed by proprietor George W. Baker whose 1908 home at 28 Gormley Road East acted as a display of the residential application of his product. The Baker House, along with the Bestard House at 38 Gormley Road East, were both built in the American Foursquare style and form part of Richmond Hill's Gormley Heritage Conservation District. The tradition of concrete production in Gormley continues today with the operations of Unilock Ltd., a manufacturer of interlocking concrete paving stones.

Although research has yet to confirm whether the subject dwelling was a catalogue home, its layout and appearance raise the possibility that building plans could have been ordered by mail and built with local material. The rise of the department store and the expansion of rail travel at the turn of the 20th century grew the popularity of mail-order home building kits. Sears, Roebuck, & Company's "Modern Home No. 52" was an American Foursquare design built with concrete block. The model does have several dissimilarities with 77 Mill Street including its wide veranda porch, off-centre doorway, and lack of smooth-block accents. Given the uniform appearance of the rusticated concrete, the substantial nature of the dwelling, and the proximity of the factory in Gormley, its unlikely that Bruels moulded the concrete blocks on site—despite the growing use of small-scale cast iron moulding machines during this time.

The dwelling at 77 Mill is characterized by the use of rusticated or "rockface" concrete block punctuated by smooth or panelled block accents. In 1900, American inventor Harmon S. Palmer patented a machine for making hollow concrete blocks that laid the foundation for the burgeoning block industry. Palmer's cast-iron "downface" block machine was widely produced and copied, leading to rapid uptake and an increase in the use of concrete block in domestic architecture during the first decade of the 20th century. Early blocks were made from a mixture of Portland cement, aggregate, graded sand and water. Concrete became an economical and efficient alternative to stone and brick and was considered fireproof. Aesthetically, rusticated or "rockface" concrete block was a popular option employed to mimic the refined appearance of stone.

Alternative block designs were created by changing a block's composition and altering a machine's cast-iron face plates. Smooth or panelled blocks were sometimes used as decorative accents, as in the case of the subject dwelling which contains panelled quoins, lintels, banding, and three-course foundation. Early artistic, imitation-stone concrete block architecture is often under-recognized as a historic building material and representative of a significant period in the modernization of construction in North America. The application of residential concrete block masonry, particularly as a single material, also represents a unique architectural stage within the broader Edwardian era.

Staff are of the opinion that the subject dwelling at 77 Mill is currently in good physical condition. Interior photographs taken at the time of sale show an intact modernized interior with some remaining heritage features, namely: early or original wooden doors, flooring and wainscoting. The exterior of the structure is intact and, although the concrete does evidence a few cracking lines, these can be patched by a masonry professional and the surface texture matched. Similar to other masonry material, concrete can slowly deteriorate in the presence of moisture and dissolve salts. A site visit by staff has confirmed that exterior cracking lines present follow areas of rainwater runoff and further deterioration can be mitigated by properly diverting runoff away from the masonry.

Although the architectural integrity of the structure is intact, it has seen some modifications over the years, notably: the construction of a gabled upper-level porch and balcony and the construction of a garage addition. The balcony structure is made of wood and modern siding and contains decorative balusters and trim. Although not original to the structure, this feature adds a modern ornamental element to a characteristically unembellished façade. Staff are of the opinion that these changes have not substantially altered the character of the dwelling nor lessened its cultural heritage value.

4.3 Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value/Interest

Section 29 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act permits municipal Councils to designate properties of cultural heritage value or interest where the criteria prescribed by provincial regulation is met. In 2006, the Province issued Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to Sub-section 1(2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act where it meets one or more of the identified criteria. Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design/Physical Value, Historical/Associative Value, and Contextual Value.

As outlined below, and explained above, based on the preliminary cultural heritage assessment the subject property satisfies five (5) of the nine (9) criteria contained in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*. The cultural heritage evaluation was based on site visits and a historical review of sources at hand.

Evaluation Category	Evaluation Criteria	Meets Criteria?
	 is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method; 	Yes
Design/Physical Value	ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or;	No
	iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	No
	 has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community; 	Yes
Historical/Associative Value	ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or;	Yes
	 iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community. 	No
	i. is important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area;	Yes
Contextual Value	 ii. Is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings, or; 	Yes
	iii. Is a landmark.	No

Design/Physical Value:

i. The dwelling is a representative example the Edwardian Classical American Foursquare architectural style, popularized between 1900-1930. The American Foursquare style is typified by an unembellished design, box-like shape, hipped roof, front porch, and square plan layout. 77 Mill Street is unique in its early application of concrete block as the exclusive building material. The dwelling is composed of rusticated concrete block with smooth block accents on quoins, lintels, banding, and foundation. The dwelling is the only known example of an American Foursquare within the Community of Stouffville composed entirely of concrete. 77 Mill Street is representative of Edwardian Classicism in its formal American Foursquare design: a simple appearance, a symmetrical square layout, horizontal lines, and reserved but refined ornamentation.

- ii. **X** The property does not appear to display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- iii. **X** The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

Historical/Associative Value:

- i. ✓ The property does have direct associations with a number of local families: Bruels, Stewart, and Gray families. William Bruels (1857-1931), a German-born carpenter based in Ringwood, was attributed with the construction of the structure from local materials. Bruels is believed to have erected the dwelling for Ella Matilda Stewart (nee Gray) (1866-1939), whose family were early pioneers in the Ballantrae area.
- ii. ✓ The property does yield information that contributes to an understanding of community or culture. Staff believe that the structure was constructed with local concrete material produced in Gormley at the North American Cement Block & Tile Company. The structure is representative of the start of the residential application of concrete block as a building material. The property has also yielded information on the connection between the development of Stouffville and the early manufacturing history of Gormley.
- iii. X The property does not appear to demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to the community.

Contextual Value:

- i. The property is important in maintaining and supporting the character of the area. The property is located at the northern terminus of Mill Street's historic building fabric and acts as a transitional building to modern residential dwellings. The property maintains and supports the diverse heritage character of the neighbourhood and the varied lot fabric and configuration that exists. The dwelling's minimal setback and close siting allow the building to stand out and contribute to the intimate pedestrian character that exists in this urban area.
- ii. ✓ The property is visually and historically linked to its surroundings. The property forms part of Block D in Plan 61 (1888), the original plan subdividing this area north of Main Street. The property was built in 1911 and demonstrates the evolution of building patterns and architectural styles that can be experienced on Mill Street. The dwelling is part of a diverse collection of historic and modern residential buildings along this street.
- iii. **X** The property is not considered a landmark.

4.5 Proposed development

The development proposal submitted by the applicant for this site is to sever the existing property into two residential lots, partially demolish the rear portion of the existing dwelling

(which has just been added within the last two years), and construct a single detached dwelling as infill on the conveyed portion of the lands.

The existing dwelling, located on the retained portion of the lands, will be retained in situ. An attached two-storey addition, covered terrace area, and detached garage are also proposed for the retained portion of the lands (see Attachments 2-4).

Staff are of the opinion that the proposed development successfully sites the proposed single detached dwelling on conveyed lands further back from the street, preventing it from dominating the streetscape or competing with the heritage resource and lessening its impact on the character of the neighbourhood. The proposal does represent a modest increase in residential density through residential infill. The proposal directs intensification into an already built-up area within the vicinity of the downtown. Given the property's location in a pedestrianized neighbourhood and in proximity to the commercial core, the Stouffville GO Station transit hub, and public transportation lines, staff are of the opinion that the proposed increase in density is appropriate and suitable for this location. The subject property is also located just north of Main Street, a primary arterial road and pedestrian-focused commercial corridor. This application meets the intent of the *Growth Plan* by directing growth to built up areas through intensification.

4.1 **Options & Recommendation**

Based on the preliminary cultural heritage assessment conducted in this report, staff are of the opinion that the property at 77 Mill Street does contain sufficient cultural heritage value to merit designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Staff are of the opinion that the property meets five (5) of nine (9) criteria in all three categories as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 as criteria for determining cultural heritage value. Both policy and case law have demonstrated that properties need only meet one of the nine criteria in order to be considered for designation by a municipal Council. Staff are also of the opinion that the proposed development outlined in PRE-19-10, CA-19-10, & CA-19-11 is a suitable use of the lands and effectively maintains the heritage value of the dwelling while permitting compatible development.

Option A (Recommended)

Staff recommend that the property located at 77 Mill Street be considered for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff are of the opinion that the designation of the subject property will adequately protect the heritage features of the property while also permitting compatible development. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations or additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property or affect its resale value.

Staff are also recommending that Council endorse the development proposal for the subject property put forward by the applicant and outlined in Attachments 2-3, subject to further approvals of the Town's Committee of Adjustment.

Option B

Council may decide to decline the designation of the subject property. By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to ensure long-term, legal protection of this cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations, new construction and demolition). Under Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the property owner may obtain a Demolition Permit after the expiration of the legislated 60-day abeyance period. Council may also decide not to endorse the development proposal put forward by the applicant.

5. Next Steps

Should Council resolve to proceed with designation of 77 Mill Street, the following steps shall be undertaken by staff in consultation with the Clerk's Office and Corporate Communication staff:

- 1. Notify the owner/applicant and Ontario Heritage Trust of Council's intention to designate the property.
- 2. Publish the Notice of Intention to Designate in a local newspaper and on the Town's website.
- 3. Should no objections be received during the mandatory 30-day public objection period following publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate, bring the heritage designation by-law to Council for enactment.
- 4. Following enactment of the by-law:
 - a. Publish notice of the passing of the by-law in a local newspaper and on the Town's website
 - b. Provide a copy of the by-law, together with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and the Description of Heritage Attributes of the property, to the owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, and
 - c. Register the by-law on title to the property.

6. Financial Implications:

If Council approves proceeding with designation of the property at 77 Mill Street, the Notice of Intention to Designate and the subsequent Notice of Passing of By-Law will be advertised on the Town Page in the local newspaper. The advertising costs will be covered under the Corporate Communications advertising budget line. Costs associated with the registration of the designation by-law on title to the property will be covered by Legal Division's budget. The total costs associated with designation of the property shall not exceed \$300.

7. Attachments:

- 1. Location Map
- 2. Proposed Consent plan
- 3. Site Plan and Elevation Concept
- 4. Site Photographs
- 5. Historical Mapping & Archival Material

8. Related Reports:

May 15, 2019 – File No. CA-19-10 & CA-19-11 (Consent and Minor Variance applications).

Author: Jeremy Parsons, Heritage Planner II Department Head: Haiqing Xu, Director, Development Services For further information on this report, please contact: Jeremy Parsons, Heritage Planner II at 905-640-1910 or 1-855-642-8697 ext. 2272 or via email at Jeremy.Parsons@townofws.ca.





Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville

Consent and Minor Variance Application

Part of Block D, Plan 61 77 Mill St., Whitchurch-Stouffville Application File Nos. CA-19-10 & CA-19-11



0 30 60

Produced by Clerks Department May 1 2019 © The Corporation of The Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville © Regional Municipality of York © MPAC 2019

ATTACHMENT 2 CA-19-10 and CA-19-11 PROPOSED CONSENT PLAN



CU DENOTES SURVEY MONUNENT SET V WINTL B - STANDARD KON BAR MT STANDARD D DENOTES SURVEY MONUNENT SET V WINTL B - STANDARD KON BAR MT B - DOUCTORE BLOCK CC - CUT CRUSS - CTA - MD THE SURVEY BAS COMPLETED ON THE SAL DAY OF JUNIARY, 2019 D DONALD E. ROBERTS LTD., ONTARIO LAND SURVEYORS D DATE 2019 D DETER N. AUBREY D D DRIAL FILME SURVEY BAS COMPLETED ON THE SURVEY BAS	EVAILS ARE WITH CRID, DERIVED FROM DESERVED REPERDING POINTS A AND B. BY REAL BARE NETWORK (RTN) OBSERVATIONS, WITH ZONE 10, HADBS (CSRS)(2010.0).	I CERTIFY THAT : 1. THIS SURVEY AND PLAN ARE CORRECT AND IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE SURVEYS	2. THERE ARE NO REGISTERED EASEMENTS OR RICHT-OF-WAYS.
pi " REZISTERED FLAN 654-2947 FF " RETAINING WALL DATE 2019 FETAININ AUBREY REF NO. R " PLAN 658-2540 HP " HUNR POLE 2019 FETRI N. AUBREY REF NO. OU " ORON WALKNOW LS " UNIT STANDARD OTTEM LAND SUPER Y REF NO. PETRI N. AUBREY REF NO. PETRI N. AUBREY REF NO.	B - SURVEY MONUMENT FOUND CB - CONCRETE BLOCK SPB - STANDARD BON BAR by - BOARD FENCE 18 - KTON BAR Rt - PLAN 65R-16755	ACT, THE BURVEYORS ACT. AND THE RECULATIONS MADE UNGER THEM,	DONALD E. ROBERTS LTD., ONTARIO LAND SURVEYORS
- W ARRAL SERVICE WRE DIG CONPUSICIENT 2019 OD ALLO E ROBERTS 2012.	pl RE25STREED FLAN 654-2947 tr RE21ANING WALL DATE R PLAN 659-2540 HP HVDR0 POLE DATE QU ORIGN UNKNOWN LS USHT STANDARD QU ORIGN UNKNOWN LS USHT STANDARD		DATE PHA DATE 18-9418-1



	stacht	ment 3	- DS-028-19
	- CONEN	THE REAL	R. MARK, & A RUMAN & 2010, 4 M. Autors & Rudon & An Ru & Rudon & Rudon & Angel Rudon & Rudon 102 Address & Angel
	7.50 m	8.50 .	
630	1.50 m	1.20 m	
0.7K	1,50 re 7,50 re	a 03.0111	P H CAR HED GAZES ML HA
EDU	NLCO m	9.41 n	
DIGTH	12.63 m	19.00 m	FILL SAL & FILL & WERE
KT	33.00 X	41/57 %	
ICE - WTH HO HUM H SINCE	25.60 X	37.54 %	WE SCHOOL FOR PERSON ADDRESS OF
	INFERM	-	
	1373.67 JI	418.00 10.00	a a gion achierture
5 1 90901: 001	1311.00 AL.	0178 mm	I BE Read at most
(ii) 10101 (ii)	30.80 HR. 190.67 HLR.	2.79 op.m. 17.71 million	stoulfule, astaria, Holj
	343.61 - M.	31.50 -	547.220.5424
(E)	1500.00 117	138.00 1101	
CA 141 . 10	2011.00 -11.	261.15 19.00	
Aidh (As B+C+O)	1895.28 HL/L	174.22 m.m.	
			QUALIFICATION INFORMATION
WIDN - 83		(TEPOTED	a an Draph, C. 4 an Son-t Child & Stat
			2.00 Automotion 10.50
	7.50 m	D/0 332 m	A set a
R14	1.50 m	123 m	QUALIFICATION INFORMATION
WHE	1 <i>5</i> 0 m	5.34 m	
	7.50 m	1235 m	
04	10.00 m	800 m	
NCTH	17,63 m	22.56 m	
WOH - WEN 40 MAR URAL	17,65 m	1656 A	
1 - MON 10 STAR TADAT	2 12D X	36.04 %	THE WE WIS
- WE'N NO PEAR IERRWI	T OTOF T	HETEC	and the second
	5390.03 m.lt	501.75 H_A	
LOOR	75 751.48h	1.01 Mar. 18.00	31
	42.03 - 12	1 100-1	
ADDR	174.48 sq.1	LCP Same Padl mark	
FLOOR ACCIDION	17.49 -1	1042	6 4 5
CAVEC TIME	225 au 14.1	20.91 16.79.1	3
Delli Gallace	101 00 74	10.32 cm	
Habitater Salas o Paperal James Nel d Back D Seytema Rea (I Tan d Rithers Salaha Salar a statement Salaha Salar a salarat da salar Salar (Salarts B. B.)		211	
			1
SURVEY IN	EORMA	TION	1
			Ť
			SCA.E 1:100
2		3	WETRIC
20922	16	20	CONTRACT STOR OF ME AND AT A KONE AN ON E COMPANY TO FET STORES, F 4390
			- 4 will 10 2220 707 222 Aut 4782 Project Agene Properties of Residence Brunchale Fine Homes
LOT 8, RED PLAN 58 0034(L1)	3		77 Jan St. Sible Man, Creater L 44 1 C4 Oranna Stan Site Plan

Attachment 3 CA-19-10 and CA-19-11



Site Photographs



Looking northeast towards the subject property along Mill Street (Parsons, 2019).



Facing east towards the subject property, with the decorative concrete porch and wooden balcony in view (Parsons, 2019).



Frontal photograph of the subject property from the recent sale of the property (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



Facing southeast, showing the northern elevation and the recently constructed rear garage elevation (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



A closer view of the north wall and attached garage addition (Parsons, 2019)



South-facing view from the sidewalk along Mill Street (Parsons, 2019).



Showing the condition of the porch's upper balcony. The decorative wood trim and balustrade accents, although not original features, provide a complimentary accent to the standardized rusticated concrete cladding (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



Showing the condition of the porch's upper balcony, facing north (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



Showing the condition of the front porch with an early or original wooden door, concrete columns, and a close-up of the rusticated concrete block intended to emulate the exposed aggregate facing of stone (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



A closer view of concrete columns with a simple square capitals and entablature. Prewar concrete porches are fairly rare features and likely the only ones existing in the municipality (Parsons, 2019).



View of existing rear addition from the rear yard (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



South-facing view of the rear yard (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



North-facing view of the rear yard (Trentadue Torres Group, 2019).



Looking north along Mill Street. The subject property is located on the right (Google Maps, 2018).



Facing west from the subject property towards neighbouring properties (Google Maps, 2018).



Looking south along Mill Street. The subject property is located to the left of the image (Google Maps, 2018).



Further south along Mill Street, showing the character of the area between George Street and the subject property (Google Maps, 2018).

Historical Mapping & Archival Material

Philip Bartholomew Lehman hn Davis Abraham Abraham touffer Sen Stouffer Jun Wideman Edward Wheler PUMPLFACT Estates RC Late Abr SHA Stoufer Edward. Sarah heler Long Jacob Hoover Mathew Flint Mallip eph Mc. Mullen 18 Brown James Bu Samuel Boyer -Ocupt John Pipher O.P. John Re

The approximate location of the subject property (in red) on George Tremaine's 1860 Map of the County of York Canada West. Note the presence of Stouffer's mill pond on Duffins Creek (University of Toronto).



The approximate location of the subject property (in red) on Miles & Co.'s 1878 Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of York (McGill University).

A 334 2 reyors Certificate certify that this pl Block A REGISTRY A bly Hanning R.S. 1 88 AC hongto Fee Block 6 Block B D 1.88 AL 504 50 Owners Certificate The lots coloured bink and the 14 3 13 3 12 and lane coloured brown 16 3 15 1 3 11 treets Block Margaret. C. Street * ¥ az 109 Ac 30 1 35. The plane fired and Deposited in the Registry Office unand for the 10 Voith Reding of The County The ret day of fully + 3 at 10 30 a. The Nº 61 19 20 21 22 501 8 2 26 3 29 5 25 5 27 28 6 CERTIFIED TO BE A TRUE COPY OF PLAN . 6.L. REGISTERED IN THE LAND REGISTRY OFFICE FOR Street 400 105 THE REGISTRY DIVISION OF YORK NORTH (No 65) 32 \$05 Sec. .30 .3 PLANOF SUBDIVISION OF THAT PART OF LOTI CON. IX WHITCHURCH Margarit SONKEYED TO KGIBNEY BY W SOMERVILLE In the VILLAGE OF STOUFFVILLE Main NYA 36 6 Stract bet? Whitchurch & Markho

The original Plan of Subdivision for the subject property and surroundings located within Lot 1, Concession 9 in the former Township of Whitchurch. The subject property is located with Block D, highlighted in red. Although much of these lands were subdivided in 1888, it appears that Blocks A, B, C, D were not developed until much later. The subject property appears to be the earliest building built within Block D. Residential lots to the north were subdivided in 1994 (courtesy Fred Robbins).



The approximate location of the subject property (in red) on Charles Goad's 1910 *Fire Insurance Plan, Village of Stouffville.* The subject dwelling was still yet to be constructed (Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville).



The 1914 *Topographical Map of Ontario, Markham Sheet* showing the northern extension of Mill Street and development in the vicinity of the subject property (Ontario Council of University Libraries).



HOW TO GET ANY OF OUR PLANS FREE FULLY EXPLAINED ON PAGE 2.



MODERN HOME No. 52

Concrete Block Construction. On the opposite page we illustrate a few of the materials we specify on this our \$1,995.00 house.



DO NOT ATTEMPT BUILDING WITHOUT PLANS, don't pay an architect \$100.00 or compare in accuracy or detail with the plans we will furnish you free of charge on condition that you send us a small portion of your mill work order. If you were to attempt to build a house similar to the house illustrated above, it would cost you from \$500.00 to \$1,000.00 more. See how you can get the plans for this house free on page 2.

Sears, Roebuck & Co., Chicago, Ill.

BOOK OF MODERN HOMES

The subject property was built 1911 and may have been a Sears, Roebuck and Company catalogue home or loosely patterned from one. Although "Modern Home No. 52" was an American Foursquare design built with concrete block, it does have several external dissimilarities to 77 Mill Street (Sears Archives).



A Sears, Roebuck and Co. catalogue (Sears Archives).



An early captioned infographic of the down-facing cast-iron block moulding machine (Classic Rock Face Block).



It is very likely that the blocks were produced at the North American Cement Block & Tile Company in nearby Gormley, which was in operation prior to the construction of the subject dwelling (Classic Rock Face Block, Gormley Heritage Conservation District Inventory).



Enumerated list of heritage sites within the hamlet of Gormley or "New Gormley". Note the location of the North American Cement Block & Tile Company (Richmond Hill Public Library).

It was in 1804 that Abraham Stouffer saw the potential in the creek running through the woods of this area and felt that he could develop mills in this location. He purchased 200 acres in Whitchurch township on what is now the north side of Main Street from Russell Hoag, a Quaker who moved to the Altona area of Uxbridge township. Stouffer found the ideal site for his gristmill on the south side of Main Street, and purchased 100 acres in Markham township from John Williams in 1808. This foresight lead to the development of a small community around the creek. It would be some years before his mills were actually built, but we have record of a gristmill on the south side and a sawmill on the north in 1824.

In May of 1826, David Gibson, Provincial Surveyor, drew up a plan for Stouffer's new town, to be called Stoufferville, which has been shortened to Stouffville. The plan showed the sites of the mill and the mill pond which were on the north side. This brochure covers the residential development on the north side of Main in the centre of town.

In spite of their importance to the early development of the village, both the mills and the millpond disappeared from Stouffville's landscape soon after the arrival of the train.

Mill Street was once the lane that connected the sawmill and the millpond. As you walk north, the first two houses (#18 & #22) are on the site of William "Herbert" Avery's blacksmith shop and home (c.1901-19). Mill buildings had been in this vicinity with a store and post office prior to the blacksmith shop, #18 has replaced the shop. Rev. Morton started to build it, and it was finished by Ambrose Stover in 1938. #22 was moved to this site from the east end, serving as Avery's,

then as his successor, Murray Hill's home to 1938. #28 was the home of H.W. Shaw, a dry goods merchant on Main Street, and Martin Tait, a butcher with a shop across from the clock tower.

Originally Dr. James Freel's home in the east end [built c1850], #48 is definitely

[built c1850], #48 is definitely older than its renovations let on. It was moved here after 1910 by his grandson Ira to be used as a rental home.

#58/60 is a unique, semidetached dwelling in the 19th century Gothic style. It was built in two phases with the south part built in 1896 and the north part a year or two later. The considerable additions and board and batten cladding have not altered the feel. Look behind the porch railing to see the uneven door steps, indicative to the different floor levels within.

Just before the 1900s subdivision we find #77 on the east side. Built in 1911 by William Bruels for a widow, Mrs. Alexander Stewart, this house could well have been purchased from a department store catalogue, possibly with blocks made by *Gormley Concrete*

Block Co. (1908-21). Returning south along Mill, #49 dates to 1888, and the addition to 1907; spruce trees and a fence post remind us that many of the oldest

homes sat on larger village lots, with a barn for the horse, a run for the chickens and a small house with a crescent moon on the door in the yard. The barn still stands at the rear of the lot and can be seen when we walk up the street behind.

#33, built for Elijah Pennock (c.1895), was the residence of Rev. Samuel (Grampa) Goudie for many years. He was well known throughout the provincial Mennonite community, having served as an associate editor of the church newspaper, the Gospel Banner.

Turn left onto *George Street*: One suggestion for the origin of the street name is the "George Brothers", who were owners of the sash and door factory on Edward Street (see brochure #8). Mrs. George lived at #67 Church across from George Street.

#69 George St. is another house moved to its current location from the east end where it may have been a commercial building. It has had significant renovations in recent years. *The street takes an abrupt turn to the north.* #63 George has been restored to its original

Victorian style, with its touches of ornament and full front porch. It was built c.1876 for Charles Perry, a painter and decorator. Detour briefly down Duchess Street #22 is

Detour briefly down *Duchess Street*. #22 is one of several traditional Gothic homes on the tour. Others will be found on Church Street at



numbers 80, 126 and 61. Among the features of these simple, 19th century, 1½storey houses is the central gable which often contains a pointed arch, Gothe window. This particular home was built for Joe Mertens Sr., uncle of prominent photographer, William Mertens.

#25 Duchess is another style which repeated several times on Church Street (84, 108, 115, 93 & 47). This high

Victorian look features bayed wings, ornate gingerbread in the gables, coined corners and a belled roof over the porch. Around the corner to the north, back-to-back with this house, #59 George has many of the same ornamental features, including the use of two colours of brick. While the former is built on a cross plan, the latter is larger and built on a square plan. They were constructed in the late 1880s for brothers, John and Thomas Casely.

Dominating the area, at the north end of *Park Street* (as this road was called) was one of Stouffville's major early recreation complexes, the *Maple Leaf Rink*. Built by Nathan Forsyth in 1906, it was used until the 1920s, when a new rink was built in Memorial Park.



Turn east past the newer homes of George St., then turn left at *Church Street* noting first the houses on the west side.

Nathan Forsyth (1852-1948) was a local master builder. His distinctive designs include elliptical arch windows (usually with stained glass in the arch), soldier brick or corbelling over the windows, a porch/balcony projection at the entrance in wood or brick, and a sturdy,

Excerpt from the *Stouffville Village Walking Tour: Stouffville Centre North* pamphlet produced by the former Whitchurch-Stouffville Historical Society. Note that the subject property is featured and described (courtesy Fred Robbins).

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

77 Mill Street, Whitchurch-Stouffville

Description of Historic Place

The property known municipally as 77 Mill Street is located within Lot 1, Concession 9 in the former Township of Whitchurch. The property is found on the east side of Mill Street, approximately 230 metres north of Main Street, in a neighbourhood of varied heritage character. The property contains a two-storey single detached dwelling built in 1911 with moulded concrete block. The dwelling acts as the northern terminus to Mill Street's historic building fabric and acts and a transitional building to modern residential lots. The property's heritage designation is reserved to the exterior of the heritage resource itself on the southern portion of the lot and does not extend to any accessory structures or landscape features.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property located at 77 Mill Street has cultural heritage value as the only known American Foursquare dwelling made entirely of concrete block in the community of Stouffville. The structure is believed to have been constructed by William Bruels (1857-1931) for Ella Matilda Stewart (1866-1939) in 1911 using material produced at the North American Cement Block & Tile Company in Gormley. As such, the dwelling is demonstrative of a clear connection between the growth of Stouffville and the concrete manufacturing activities in Gormley at the turn of the 20th century. 77 Mill Street is representative of Edwardian Classicism in its formal American Foursquare design: a simple but formal appearance, a symmetrical square layout, horizontal lines, and reserved but refined ornamentation. The dwelling is also indicative of an architectural period where practicality, efficiency, and cost-savings were increasingly valued as a result of broader trends such as the rise of corporate department stores, ubiquitous mail advertising, and improved transportation.

Heritage Attributes:

The heritage attributes of the property at 77 Mill Street that display its cultural heritage value include:

- Edwardian Classical American Foursquare design;
- Concrete block construction on all four elevations;
- Hip roof profile;
- All windows and window openings including front windows capped with horizontal transom lights;
- Early or original wooden front doorway along with hardware;
- Rusticated or rock-face concrete block exterior;
- Smooth panelled concrete block accents, including:
 - o Alternating quoins;
 - o Lintels;
 - Three-course foundation; and,
 - o Banding between first and second stories.
- Two-storey porch structure, including:

- First-level concrete portico section complete with concrete base and concrete columns (pillars, capitals, entablature, and bases); and,
- Second-level balcony section, including wooden balusters and decorative wooden trim.

Notice of Intention to Designate

77 Mill Street, Whitchurch-Stouffville

The Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville intends to designate 77 Mill Street, in the community of Stouffville, under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as being a property of cultural heritage value.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property known municipally as 77 Mill Street is located on the east side of Mill Street, approximately 230 metres north of Main Street, in a neighbourhood of varied heritage character. The property contains a two-storey single detached dwelling built in 1911 with moulded concrete block. The dwelling acts as the northern terminus to Mill Street's historic building fabric and acts and a transitional building to modern residential lots. The property's heritage designation is reserved to the exterior of the heritage resource itself on the southern portion of the lot and does not extend to any accessory structures or landscape features.

The property located at 77 Mill Street has cultural heritage value as the only known American Foursquare dwelling made entirely of concrete block in the community of Stouffville. The structure is believed to have been constructed by William Bruels (1857-1931) for Ella Matilda Stewart (1866-1939) in 1911 using material produced at the North American Cement Block & Tile Company in Gormley. As such, the dwelling is demonstrative of a clear connection between the growth of Stouffville and the concrete manufacturing activities in Gormley at the turn of the 20th century. 77 Mill Street is representative of Edwardian Classicism in its formal American Foursquare design: a simple but formal appearance, a symmetrical square layout, horizontal lines, and reserved but refined ornamentation. The dwelling is also indicative of an architectural period where practicality, efficiency, and cost-savings were increasingly valued as a result of broader trends such as the rise of corporate department stores, ubiquitous mail advertising, and improved transportation.

A full Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of Heritage Attributes can be found online at <u>http://www.townofws.ca/en/town-hall/News-and-Public-Notices.aspx</u> or viewed in person at Town Hall (Clerks office), 111 Sandiford Drive, Whitchurch-Stouffville, Ontario, L4A 0Z8, during regular business hours.

Written Notice of Objection

Any person may, within 30 days after the date of the publication of the Notice, serve written notice of their objections to the proposed designation, together with a statement for the objection and relevant facts.

Dated at Whitchurch-Stouffville, this ____ day of May 2019.

Gillian Angus-Traill, Town Clerk, Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville Stouffville, Ontario

CONTACT: Jeremy Parsons, Heritage Planner II, Development Services, Phone: (905) 640-1910 ext. 2272, E-mail: <u>Jeremy.Parsons@townofws.ca</u>.